Psychotherapy for Postpartum Depression in Iranian Women: A Systematic Review and Meta-Analysis

Masumeh Ghazanfarpour¹, Fatemeh Rajab Dizavandi², Leila Kargarfard³, Elahe Heidari⁴, Talat Khadivzadeh¹, *Masumeh Saeidi⁵, Somayeh Abdolahian⁶, Minoo Safaei¹

¹Evidence - Based Care Research Center, Mashhad University of Medical Sciences, Mashhad, Iran. ²Faculty Member, Department of Community Health and Psychiatric Nursing, School of Nursing and Midwifery, Mashhad University of Medical Sciences, Mashhad, Iran. ³Instructor of Fatemeh School and Midwifery, Shiraz University of Medical Sciences, Iran. ⁴Assistant Professor, Department of Pediatrics, Faculty of Medicine, Mashhad university of Medical Sciences, Mashhad, Iran. ⁵Student Research Committee, Department of Medical Education, Faculty of Medicine, Tehran University of Medical Sciences, Tehran, Iran. ⁶Student Research Committee, Department of Midwifery and Reproductive Health, Nursing and Midwifery School, Shahid Beheshti University of Medical Sciences, Tehran, Iran.

Abstract

Background: Postpartum depression (PPD) is a type of disorder could have serious effects on the mother, the baby, and other family members, given the contradictory results of the previous studies about the effect of education programs, aim of the present study was to evaluate the effect of educational programs on postpartum depression in Iranian women.

Materials and Methods: English electronic information databases such as Medline (via PubMed), Scopus, ISI Web of Science, EMBASE, and Cochrane Library were searched until February 2018. In addition, Iran doc, Barakatskns, Magiran, Medlib, SID, and google scholar were searched using equivalent keywords in Persian until February 2018. Cochrane Q test (p<0.05 as statistically significant), and I² index were used to evaluate heterogeneity. Funnel plot and Egger’s regression were conducted to detect publication bias.

Results: The finding of the Meta-analysis indicate that education interventions was found to be more effective and could significantly improve postpartum depression (Standard Mean division (SMD) =1.44; P<0.001; Confidence Interval [CI] =0.595 to 2.40; Heterogeneity p=0.001; I²=87%). The funnel plot appears asymmetric with an outlier study. However, this finding was not confirmed by Egger's test that was nonsignificant (p=0.262), and show no asymmetry. The level of depression was lower in women receiving problem-solving skills in compared to who received no intervention (SMD =1.83; P<0.001); the level of depression showed a significant borderline decline in women receiving Mindfulness-based Cognitive Therapy compared to those who did not receive intervention (SMD =1.20; P=0.089).

Conclusion: Based on the finding of the current meta-analysis, it can be said that educational programs that teaches Mindfulness-based cognitive and problem-solving skills can improve of postpartum depression.

Key Words: Iran, Depression, Educational Program, Meta-analysis, Postpartum, Women.


Corresponding Author:
Masumeh Saeidi, Faculty of Medicine, Tehran University of Medical Sciences, Tehran, Iran.
E-mail: Masumeh_Saeedi@yahoo.com
Received date: Jan.17, 2018; Accepted date: Feb.22, 2018
Psychotherapy for Postpartum Depression

1- INTRODUCTION

Postpartum depression (PPD) is a type of disorder that affects some women within the first 2 to 6 weeks following childbirth. Symptoms may include crying episodes, despondency, mood swings, feelings of worthlessness and inability to perform maternal role (1-3). Postpartum depression is a common disorder, affecting 10 to 30% of childbearing women (4-6). In a meta-analysis, a total of 41 studies met the inclusion criteria. The pooled prevalence of PPD in Iran was reported to be 25.3% (95% Confidence Interval [CI]: 22.7% -27.9%) (7). Psychological problems such as PPD account for more than 12.5% of referrals to women's healthcare centers (8). The cause of PPD has not been specifically determined so far (9-12). Some researchers consider this disorder as a response to hormonal imbalance after childbirth, particularly the loss of estrogen, estradiol, tryptophan, and endorphin, as well as elevated levels of prolactin and cortisol (1, 13, 14).

Other possible reasons could include disturbed adjustment of sleep and diet, and the baby's helplessness (1, 15, 16). Postpartum depression could have serious effects on the mother, the baby, and other family members, which leads to resultant complications for the mother-child relationship, and adversely affects the growth and development of the infant (5, 17-20). It can also cause behavioral, social and emotional problems in such children. In some severe cases of this disorder, depressed mother has been reported to even commit infanticide. In fact, the PPD has a significant negative impact on all aspects of the quality of life of the mothers. Women affected by the PPD may experience different problems in their social activities, individual performance, and household chores, exerting a negative influence on the mood of other family members. According to previous studies, depressed women's spouses are often more likely to develop depression as well, which increases marital conflicts (16, 21-26). Studies and evidences demonstrate that psychological and educational interventions are effective in reducing postpartum depression, and can improve the quality of life of the mothers without having any negative influence or complication (1). Given the contradictory results of the previous studies about the effect of education programs on the postpartum depression, the inadequacy of the educations available for the mothers, the high prevalence of this disorder in Iran, and the adverse effects of depression on health of the mothers, of the family and of society, we aimed to conduct the present meta-analysis in this regard. The aim of the present study was to evaluate the effect of educational programs on postpartum depression.

2- MATERIALS AND METHODS

2-1. Method

To perform the systematic review, English electronic information databases such as Medline (via PubMed), Scopus, ISI Web of Science, EMBASE, and Cochrane Library were searched without publication date restrictions until February 2018, 2018. Following keywords were used to identify articles related to the effect of education program on postpartum depression (PPD). English keywords were used to search databases: "Depression", "Intervention", "Iran", "Postpartum" "Psychotherapy", and "Women".

In addition, IranDoc, BarakatKns, Magiran, Medlib, Google Scholar, Magiran, and SID were searched using equivalent keywords in Persian till to February 2018. Also, the references of the relevant articles were investigated to find further related articles. Two authors independently reviewed the titles and abstracts of the articles. If the subject was relevant, the full text article was extracted, and reviewed by the
authors. Finally, articles meeting inclusion criteria were evaluated.

2-2. Inclusion criteria
Studies were included into systematic review if they had the following criteria:

- Experimental study (Quasi-experimental or clinical trials),
- Reported severity of postpartum depression with validated instrument tool,
- Used a psychotherapeutic intervention.

2-3. Data extraction
Two authors independently extracted following data based on a pre-defined checklist designed by authors: name of first author, year of publish, region of study (city), Measurement tool, whether randomization was done or not, whether randomization technique was suitable or not, a number of participants in intervention and control group, level of depression complaints, age, comparability of the treatment and control groups, design, and major relevant findings.

2-4. Quality assessment of the included studies

2-5. Statistical analyses
The main effect size was calculated as standardized difference in means (SMD). We reported the results based on a random effects model because high heterogeneity across studies. Cochrane Q test (p<0.05 as statistically significant), and I² index were used to evaluate heterogeneity. We also conducted a funnel plot and Egger’s regression to detect publication bias.

3- RESULTS
Table.1 shows the characteristic of five studies included in current study (Please see the end of paper). Process of selection of included studies in the education interventions met analysis was shown in Figure.1. The finding of the Meta-analysis indicate that education interventions was found to be more effective and could significantly improve postpartum depression (Standard Mean division (SMD) =1.49; P=0.001; 95%CI= 0.595 to 2.40, at five trial studies (1, 8, 27-29). However, Heterogeneity across studies were very high (p<0.001; I²=87%). The funnel plot is shown in Figure.2.

We performed sensitivity analysis to detect potential source (outlier study) of heterogeneity. However, heterogeneity continued to remain after excluding one by one study. Also, sensitivity analysis indicated the robust of meta-analysis by showing similar SMD before and after excluding one by one study. We also performed subgroup analysis by type of intervention because of high heterogeneity.

At current systematic review, two studies (Parsa et al. and Nasiri et al.) assessed the effect of problem-solving skills on postpartum depression. Level of depression was lower in women receiving problem-solving skills in compared to who received no intervention (SMD =1.83; P<0.001; 95% CI= 1.43 to 2.33) (1, 28).

Heterogeneity was 0% among studies that assessed effect of Problem-solving skills on postpartum depression. In Ghadam pour et al. and Abad et al.'s studies, level of depression showed a significant borendline decline in women receiving Mindfulness-based Cognitive Therapy incomparably to those who did not receive intervention (SMD =1.20; P=0.089; 95% CI= 2.58 to 1.73) (17, 29). Heterogeneity was I²=83% among studies that assessed effect of Mindfulness-based cognitive on postpartum depression. Subgroup analysis
showed that type of intervention (Mindfulness-based cognitive Therapy vs. Problem-solving skills) might be the source of heterogeneity. Naddap et al. conducted a Quasi-experimental. They divided subjects into two equal groups to receive Group psychotherapy (n=15) and control group (n=15). Post partum depression improved significantly in group psychotherapy compared to control group (27). Pooled effect sizes were larger in studies assessed the effect of Problem-solving skill training compared to Mindfulness–based cognitive therapy (p<0.001). We made a funnel plot to evaluate publication bias (Figure 5). The funnel plot appears asymmetric with an outlier study. However, this finding was not confirmed by Egger's test that was non-significant (p=0.262), and show no asymmetry.

Fig.1: Flowchart of included studies.
Fig. 2: Effects of educational programs on postpartum depression. The horizontal lines denote the 95% confidence interval, ■ point estimate (size of the square corresponds to its weight); ♦, combined Overall effect of treatment.

Fig. 3: Effects of Mindfulness-based cognitive Therapy programs on postpartum depression. The horizontal lines denote the 95% confidence interval, ■ point estimate (size of the square corresponds to its weight); ♦, combined Overall effect of treatment.
Psychotherapy for Postpartum Depression

Fig. 4: Effects of problem-solving skills programs on postpartum depression. The horizontal lines denote the 95% confidence interval, ■ point estimate (size of the square corresponds to its weight); ♦, combined Overall effect of treatment.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Study name</th>
<th>Std diff in means</th>
<th>Std error</th>
<th>Variance</th>
<th>Lower limit</th>
<th>Upper limit</th>
<th>Z-Value</th>
<th>p-Value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Kordi</td>
<td>1.864</td>
<td>0.326</td>
<td>0.106</td>
<td>1.225</td>
<td>2.503</td>
<td>5.716</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parsa</td>
<td>1.812</td>
<td>0.262</td>
<td>0.069</td>
<td>1.298</td>
<td>2.326</td>
<td>6.908</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1.803</td>
<td>0.204</td>
<td>0.042</td>
<td>1.432</td>
<td>2.233</td>
<td>8.966</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

CI: Confidence interval; SMD: Standardized mean difference.

Fig. 5: Funnel plot of results from included published studies on the effects of education program on postpartum depression.
4- DISCUSSION

To best our knowledge, this is the first meta-analysis assessed the effect of psychotherapy treatment for postpartum depression. Five studies were included into meta-analysis. Two studies used Problem-solving skills (1, 28); one study utilized Group psychotherapy (27) and two studies used mindfulness-based cognitive therapy (17, 29). In Kordi et al., depressive symptoms decreased significantly in problem-solving skills group compared to control group (28). In Naddaf et al., postpartum depression improved significantly in group psychotherapy compared to control group (27). In Ghadam pour et al.’s study, the Beck Depression Inventory-II (BDI-II) decreased significantly in Mindfulness-based cognitive therapy group compared to control group (17).

In Bakhtiari et al.’s study BDI decreased significantly in mindfulness-based cognitive group compared to control group (29). In Parsa et al.’s study, based on Edinburgh scale, postpartum depression improved significantly in Problem-solving skills group compared to control group. According to forest plot, three studies showed educational program were effective in decreasing severity of depression (1, 28, 29). In contrast in two studies, severity of postpartum depression decreased non-significantly. Discrepancy between studies may be related to difference in content from training programmers, sample size, severity of depression, different instrument tool and setting. After of combination of the result of five studies in a meta-analysis, educational intervention was found to be more effective and could significantly improve postpartum depression.

4-1. Limitation of study

This systematic review had several limitations that need to be noted and discussed. The first limitations are large heterogeneity among studies that may be due to different instrument tool, content from training programmers, difference in severity of depression, difference in sample size and setting. The second, some of studies did not provide the information of education session. Third limitation, Higgins (30) suggested that a minimum of ten studies need to conduct a meta-regression. Therefore, the number of studies included in the systematic review was too small to perform a Meta regression to detect whether severity of depression impact on the result of meta-analysis. However, sensitivity analysis showed no impact of severity of depression on result. Fourth limitation, most of studies included into meta-analysis had a small sample size that larger sample size must be considered in future study. Fifth, the fact that all the studies performed in Iran may limit the generalizability of the finding of the meta-analysis to other countries. Last, despite of that fact that we performed a comprehensive search, but it is possible that some of studies be missed length of the systematic review is all studies used validated and reliable instrument tool. Also, studies were well-designed and described base on consort guideline.

5- CONCLUSIONS

Based on the finding of the current meta-analysis, it can be said that educational programs that teaches Mindfulness-based cognitive and Problem-solving skills, can improve postpartum depression. Psychotherapy and educational intervention can offer as an alternative to pharmacotherapy particularly for women who are concern about side effect of herbal and chemical drugs.

6- CONFLICT OF INTEREST

All the authors declare that they have no conflict of interest.

7- REFERENCES
Psychotherapy for Postpartum Depression


21. Malta LA, McDonald SW, Hegadoren KM, Weller CA, Tough SC. Influence of interpersonal violence on maternal anxiety, depression, stress and parenting morale in the early postpartum: a community based


**Table 1:** Characteristics of 5 studies included in our systematic review.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author, City, Year, Reference</th>
<th>Design</th>
<th>Age</th>
<th>Level of complaints and measurement tool</th>
<th>Measurement tool</th>
<th>Type of interventions</th>
<th>Participants</th>
<th>randomization /Suitable randomization technique</th>
<th>Basel Comparability of the treatment and control groups</th>
<th>Major relevant findings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Parsa et al., Hamadan of Iran, 2016 (1)</td>
<td>Randomised controlled trials (RCTS)</td>
<td>Age range 19-23 years</td>
<td>10-15 scores based on Edinburgh scale</td>
<td>Edinburgh Scale</td>
<td>Problem-solving skills / Eight sessions weekly</td>
<td>Intervention (n=41) and control (n=41)</td>
<td>Yes/no</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Edinburgh Scale improved significantly in intervention group compared to control group.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ghadampour et al., Tabriz of Iran, 2016 (17)</td>
<td>Quasi-experimental</td>
<td>26 years</td>
<td>High depression according to BDI</td>
<td>Beck Depression Inventory-II</td>
<td>Mindfulness-based cognitive Therapy Eight sessions (two sessions a week)</td>
<td>Intervention (n=15), and control (n=15)</td>
<td>Convenience method/no</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Beck Depression Inventory-II decreased significantly in intervention group compared to control group.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Naddap et al., Mashhad of Iran, 2012, (27)</td>
<td>Quasi-experimental</td>
<td>23.29 years</td>
<td>Edinburgh Scale ≥10 Mild-moderate depression</td>
<td>Edinburgh Scale</td>
<td>Group psychotherapy ten session, control/ no intervention</td>
<td>Intervention (n=13), and control (n=13)</td>
<td>Yes/no</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Edinburgh Scale improved significantly in intervention group compared to control group.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kordi et al., Mashhad of Iran, 2012 (28)</td>
<td>Randomised controlled trials (RCTS)</td>
<td>Intervention =25.8 years; Control group=25.7 years</td>
<td>Edinburgh Scale ≥10 Beck Depression1 between 4 to 28</td>
<td>Edinburgh Scale</td>
<td>Problem-solving skills / Six sessions of 45-50 min; control/ no intervention</td>
<td>Intervention (n=26), and control (n=28)</td>
<td>Yes/no</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Depressive symptoms decreased significantly in problem-solving skills group compared to control group.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bakhtiar et al., Esfahan of Iran, 2012 (29)</td>
<td>Experimental</td>
<td>Intervention group =24 years, and control group=26 years</td>
<td>At least 5-7 scores based on Beck depression inventory (BDI)</td>
<td>Beck depression</td>
<td>Mindfulness-based cognitive Therapy Eight sessions weekly</td>
<td>Intervention (n=15) and control (n=15)</td>
<td>Yes/no</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>BDI decreased significantly in intervention group compared to control group.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>