A Systematic Review of the Effect of Aromatherapy and Storytelling on Anxiety in Children during Dentistry

Sara Kharghani1, Rana Tafreshi2, Shahrazad Sheikh1, Farzaneh Fazeli4, Farzaneh Barkhordari Ahmadi5, *Samaneh Norooziasl6, Imane Khorsand7, Roozbeh Nasibeh8

1Department of Anesthesiology, Mashhad University of Medical Sciences, Mashhad, Iran. 2Department of Pediatrics, Faculty of Medicine, Mashhad university of Medical Sciences, Mashhad, Iran. 3Fellowship of Pediatrics Anesthesiology, Department of Anesthesiology, Mashhad University of Medical Sciences, Mashhad, Iran. 4Fellowship of Intensive Care Medicine, Department of Anesthesiology, Mashhad University of Medical Sciences, Mashhad, Iran. 5Department of Anesthesia, Faculty of Para-medicine, Hormozgan University of Medical Sciences, Bandar Abbas, Iran. 6Assistant Professor of Pediatric Endocrinology, Department of Pediatrics, Faculty of Medicine, Mashhad University of Medical Sciences, Mashhad, Iran. 7Department of Parasitology and Mycology, Ghaem Hospital, Mashhad University of Medical Sciences, Mashhad, Iran. 8Mother and Child Welfare Research Center, Hormozgan University of Medical Sciences, Bandar Abbas, Iran.

Abstract

Background
There is limited study and a lack of systematic review in the field of aromatherapy with orange and storytelling and their positive effects as a safe, simple and low-cost. The present study is aimed to provide a comprehensive review of the alleviating effects of aromatherapy with orange and therapeutic storytelling on anxiety during dentistry.

Materials and Methods: Systemic search of online databases (Medline, Web of Science, Cochrane, EMBASE and Scopus), for randomized control trial and non-randomized prospective or retrospective clinical studies without time and language limitation, using related keyword combinations were searched up to Mar 2019. Two reviewers did study selection and the evaluation of studies was conducted by Jadad scale.

Results: Finally, three studies were included in a systematic review. In the first study, salivary cortisol and pulse rate improved significantly in both aromatherapies with and without orange aroma. In the second study, there was no significant difference in the mean of blood pressure, oxygen saturation, and pulse rate between groups (orange essential oil and without aroma) of children during dental treatment; anxiety level was assessed with Venham's picture scale. Comparison between groups regarding Venham’s picture test was significant. In the third study, there was significant decrease of anxiety, pain and anger in the storytelling psychotherapy group compared with the placebo and control groups of children receiving treatment by the dentist.

Conclusion
Both methods, orange odor and storytelling, were effectiveness in decreasing the anxiety level of children receiving dental treatment.

Key Words: Anxiety, Aromatherapy, Children, Dentistry, Storytelling.


*Corresponding Author:
Samaneh Norooziasl, Assistant Professor of Pediatric Endocrinology, Department of Pediatrics, Faculty of Medicine, Mashhad University of Medical Sciences, Mashhad, Iran.
Email: Norouziasls@mums.ac.ir
Received date: Sept.17, 2019; Accepted date: Feb.12, 2020
1- INTRODUCTION

Since dental anxiety is historically rooted in dentistry, the assorted ways of controlling pain have been developed over decades and centuries. Children's frustration and anxiety in dentistry is very important one, appearing as negative behaviors during examination, such as fear, anxiety, pain and anger. Anxiety and fear related behaviors in children are considered the most difficult aspects of child control (1). These behaviors are the consequences of separation from the mother, exposure to the dental equipment, and disparate dental treatment methods. Anxiety in children and its repetition during the following therapeutic sessions will assuredly affect the efficiency of the dentist so that it lessens the probability of successful treatment (2).

Pediatric anxiety is commonly initiated by seeing a syringe (3). Fear in children is also voiced immediately after seeing the needle; meanwhile the sudden movement of children may cause injury by the needle (4-6). Anxiety has a variety of effects on children's life; in addition to the anxiety and fear the children are faced with, these feelings have some other consequences for the patient such as disregard for oral health, pain, and abscess, loss of milk and permanent teeth and occlusion dislocation.

Anxiety at a lower level, can lead to irregular referrals and lack of follow-up treatments (7). Anxiety can cause problems such as sleep disorder and low self-esteem (8). Children express fear in different ways (9). Pain and anxiety can raise the heart rate, blood pressure, respiration rate and unintentional body movements (10). Accordingly, anxiety control is one of the most important factors in successful treatment. Although there are various ways to control dental anxiety, the primary one is short-term distraction. Other control techniques for dental anxiety include usage of sedative and soporific drugs (11), psychological techniques (e.g., storytelling) (11), and combination of both techniques (12). Aromatherapy has also been reported effective in controlling anxiety (13). The use of complementary therapies as a low-risk, cost-effective, easy-to-use treatment with limited side effects is expanding in health care centers (14-16). One of the methods of complementary and alternative medicine is aromatherapy (17). Oils utilized in aromatherapy containing eucalyptus, jasmine, chamomile, sage, orange, spring orange, rose, and lavender (18). Citrus fruits also have positive antioxidant impact as an important source of phalaenoid (19-22). Citrus fruits are one of the most important commercial fruit crops grown worldwide (23).

Orange peel essential oil is one of the most prevalent and important essential oils produced worldwide, with a high reputation being due to its fragrance, making it easy to deal with and thus benefit from its therapeutic properties. Orange peel essence benefits from the following properties: transparency, pleasantness, fragrance, and high level of freshness just like an orange fruit. The essential oil of orange peel with the scientific name *Citrus Science*, consists of limonene, myrrh, linalool, octane, decanal, etc. (24, 25).

The results of a study in which the effect of orange and lavender essential oils was examined on dental patients, showed an alleviating effect on anxiety, confirming the theory that inhalation of aromatic substances such as orange essence is effective in stress control in dentistry (26). According to another study, psychotherapy, such as storytelling, can reduce anxiety, pain, and anger due to dentistry (27). There is limited study and a lack of systematic review in the field of aromatherapy with orange, and storytelling and their positive effects as a safe, simple and low-cost. The present study is aimed to provide a comprehensive review of the
alleviating effects of aromatherapy with orange and therapeutic storytelling on anxiety during dentistry.

2- MATERIALS AND METHODS

2-1. Study design

Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic review and Meta-Analysis (PRISMA) checklist was used as a template for this review (28).

2-2. Search strategy

To find clinical trials on the effects of aromatherapy and therapeutic storytelling on children's anxiety during dental procedures, systematic research of electronic databases: Medline (via PubMed), Web of Science, Cochrane, EMBASE and Scopus were searched without time and language limitation. Search words were a combination of (Aroma OR aromatherapy OR olfactory OR odors OR oils OR storytelling) AND (Dental OR dental health services). Figure.1 shows a flow chart of the process used to select studies. Two reviewers did the search independently and in duplication, the supervisor resolved any discrepancies between the reviews. In addition, in this search, date of publication was not considered and any articles up to Mar 10, 2019 were included.

2-3. Study selection

A database search was done for possible studies, abstracts of the studies were screened for identification of eligible studies, full text articles were obtained and assessed and a final list of included studies was made. This process was done independently and in duplication by two reviewers and any discrepancies was resolved by a third reviewer.

2-4. Included studies

Randomized controlled trials (RCT), clinical studies both randomized and nonrandomized either retrospective or prospective.

2-5. Selection of related studies

A selection of relevant studies was independently implemented. Initially, all articles that appeared to meet the inclusion and exclusion criteria were selected by reading the abstracts of the articles, then the full texts of the relevant articles were carefully reviewed, and the articles that met the inclusion and exclusion criteria enrolled in the systematic review. References to related articles and review articles on the subject of the study were also reviewed.

2-6. Data extraction

A checklist of necessary study information provided in Table.1 include, author's name, year, measurable clinical criteria, and type of intervention/control, number and age, type of design, country, and main outcomes. Two reviewers collected the data independently and a third reviewer resolved any discrepancies.

2-7. Quality assessment

The evaluation of studies was conducted by Jadad scale (29). This scale uses three criteria to rate the articles: randomization, blindness, and a report of dropped or missed cases to be tracked. The evaluation score ranged from zero to five (Table.2). Two reviewers did the assessment independently.
### Table-1: Some of characteristics of included studies.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author, Year, Country, Reference</th>
<th>Tool</th>
<th>Type of designee</th>
<th>Number of participants and age group</th>
<th>Type of intervention/control</th>
<th>Measurable clinical criteria</th>
<th>Results</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pakdaman and Davodi, 2015, Iran, (32)</td>
<td>CFSS-DS</td>
<td>Intervention</td>
<td>39 children</td>
<td>Narrative therapy o</td>
<td>Anxiety, pain and anger</td>
<td>There were significant decreases on anxiety, pain and anger in the control group compared with placebo and control groups in children during dental treatment.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Soni et al., 2018, India, (31)</td>
<td>CFSS-DS</td>
<td>Original Control Trial</td>
<td>30 children (15 boys, 15 girls) Between 6 and 9 years</td>
<td>Orange essential oil/without aroma</td>
<td>Blood pressure, pulse and oxygen saturation</td>
<td>Salivary cortisol and pulse rate improved significantly in both aromatherapies with and without orange aroma.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jaafarzadeh et al., 2019, Iran, (30)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Clinical trials and blind trials</td>
<td>30 children (10 boys, 20 girls) 6 to 9 years</td>
<td>Orange essence/any aroma (control)</td>
<td>Saliva pulse and cortisol</td>
<td>Inhalation of orange can decrease anxiety state because salivary cortisol and pulse rate decreased significantly as indicators of anxiety state in children during dental treatment.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**CFSS-DS: Children's Fear Survey Schedule.**

### Table-2: The evaluation of quality of included studies by Jadad scale (29).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author, Year, Country, Reference</th>
<th>Randomization</th>
<th>Blinding</th>
<th>Report of dropping out</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pakdaman and Davodi, 2015, Iran, (32)</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Soni et al., 2018, India, (31)</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jaafarzadeh et al., 2019 Iran, (30)</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 3- RESULTS

Finally, three studies were included into systematic review (30-32) (Figure.1). In Jaafarzadeh et al. salivary cortisol and pulse rate improved significantly in both aromatherapy with and without orange aroma (P=0.014, P=0.005, Paired-t-test, respectively). It seems inhalation of orange can decrease anxiety state because salivary cortisol and pulse rate decreased significantly as an indicator of anxiety state in children during dental treatment (30). In Soni et al.’s study, there was no significant difference in means of blood pressure, oxygen saturation, and pulse rate between the groups (orange essential oil and without aroma) in children during Pakdaman and Davodi’s study, there were significant decreases of anxiety, pain and anger in the intervention group compared with the placebo and control groups in...
children receiving treatment by the dentist. The findings suggest that storytelling as psychotherapy can decrease anxiety, pain and anger amongst 4-8 years old children receiving treatment by the dentist (32).

**Fig.1**: PRISMA flowchart.

**4- DISCUSSION**

Nowadays, one of the challenges to protect children's oral health is to counteract the children's anxieties of dentistry. There are various approaches managing the anxiety of dentistry, such as stress and anxiety management through aromatherapy and cognitive therapy. Our study is the first review of clinical trials to evaluate the efficacy of aromatherapy and storytelling on anxiety disorders in children. The present study aims to determine the effect of the orange essence and the storytelling therapy utilized to control the anxiety in children during dental treatment. Herbal medicine research is a first-line medical research priority in our country. Pediatric anxiety control has influence on the dental process and the quality of pediatric dental work, and mutual satisfaction. The usage of complementary therapies as a low-risk, cost-effective, easy-to-treat and limited-effect treatment is expanding in health care centers (14-16). One of the alternative and complementary therapies is aromatherapy (17), defined as the usage of volatile oils or aromas extracted from fragrant plants for the therapeutic purposes (33), which
Aromatherapy and Storytelling on Anxiety of Dentistry in Children

can be described as a part of an integrated and multidisciplinary event used to optimize outcomes for children with various health issues. The use of aromatherapy could assist staff in efficacious care of patients (34). Extensive clinical research is currently being undertaken concerning use of aromatherapy and herbal essences worldwide (15). Aromatherapy stimulates the senses through smell. Scientific research has not 100% proven that aromatherapy can affect the brain and nervous system as drugs do (35). A therapeutic practice combines the nature of the science and art of nursing (36). Today, the U.S. Board of Nurses as part of holistic nursing (37) has introduced this treatment. This type of treatment in the UK is considered an accepted component of nursing practice. Nurses in more than 30 countries are licensed to use holistic complementary therapies, including aromatherapy, in holistic nursing care (38).

There is currently extensive clinical research on the various uses of aromatherapy and the use of herbal essential oils worldwide (39). Research has shown, aromatherapy to be one of the treatments available to reduce stress, anxiety, and depression (40). We found two studies, which investigated the effects of orange aromatherapy on Pediatric anxiety. In the first study, salivary cortisol and heart rate improved significantly using aromatherapy with orange aroma (30). In the second study, orange inhalation may have reduced anxiety state because salivary cortisol and heart rate decrease significantly as an indicator of anxiety state in children during dental treatment (31). Oranges are arboreal plants belonging to citrus aurantium that are grown in different parts of North and South of Iran. Due to the inexpensive Iranian raw material and Iranian processing facility, it can be an appropriate alternative to other chemical drugs that have a common usage with this essential oil (41). Production of essence from citrus peel has significant economic value (24, 25). Furthermore, many households use orange essential oil due to its delectable properties, potentiality for amalgamationwith other aromatic compounds, low cost and availability (24). Orange peel essential oils are beneficial in the food, pharmaceutical, confectionery, and cosmetics industries, as aromatic and flavoring products (42). The most important ingredients of orange peel essence are bioactive compounds, which make orange peel essential oil a suitable substitute for synthetic antioxidants. There are many reports about the antioxidant properties of orange peel essence. Orange essential oil also stimulates the central nervous system, enhances the mood, and has sedative and soothing effects (43-48).

Aromatic molecules, when they reach the olfactory area in the brain, which is closely related to the limbic system, the center of emotion control, exert their inhibitory or stimulatory effect. Inhalation of the orange essential oil is effective in reducing anxiety in hemodialysis patients and has no significant side effect (49).

Our review showed that in addition to aromatherapy, other anxiety control processes in dentistry, such as cognitive thinking through storytelling and visual storytelling, provide information to help express, promote communication, cognition, and recalling skills, and take an effective part in children's awareness as opposed to developing strategies. In these situations, therapeutic storytelling provides growth for the child. During the storytelling of the child, it seems that by observing the characters in the story who have anxiety problems, they identify the symptoms of anxiety and learn that there are other children may have problems. The child learns how to deal with the problem by engaging in the story and talking about the protagonist's problem and their
anxiety. The anxious child then tries to deal with his or her anxiety through the way the protagonist copes with his or her anxiety. The cognitive process that begins in the child with the aid of the story ends by learning the ways to overcome the problems (27)

4-1. Limitations of the study

Limited data for meta-analysis due to the small number of articles has been known as the limitation of the current study. The methodology of some of the studies reviewed in this review was systematically of low quality. These deficiencies included the absence or inadequate reporting of random allocation sequences, the absence or inadequate blindness report, the lack of intention-to-treat analysis suggested, and follow-up studies based on the censorship being designed and reported. Other limitations of this study include the small number of studies and their small sample sizes, indicating the requirement for further studies with larger sample sizes. Some studies with small sample sizes may change their results in the case of sample increment.

5- CONCLUSION

Both the orange aroma and the storytelling methods were effective in reducing anxiety levels of children treated by the dentist. The complementary and alternative therapies such as aromatherapy with orange and storytelling can be utilized in the medical center, as they are low-risk, cost-effective, easy to apply, and have limited side effects.

6- CONFLICT OF INTEREST: None.

7- REFERENCES

3. Oliveira MAHDM, De Menezes FCH, Oliveira CRB. Device For Covering a Syringe and Needle in Order to Alleviate the Fear and Anxiety Experienced During Pediatric Medical and Odontological Procedures, Such as the Administration of Anesthetics and the Like. Google Patents; 2012.
9. Dean JA, Jones J, La Quia A. McDonald and Avery's Dentistry for the Child and Adolescent. 2015.
10. Avery DR, McDonald RE, Dean JA. McDonald and Avery Dentistry for the Child and Adolescent-E-Book: Elsevier Health Sciences; 2010.
Aromatherapy and Storytelling on Anxiety of Dentistry in Children


32. Pakdaman F, Davodi I. The effect of narrative therapy on anxiety, pain and anger


